REPORT TO THE NORTHERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE Report No. 1

Date of Meeting	8th August 2012		
Application Number	N/12/00309/FUL		
Site Address	Braeside Cottage, Box Hill, SN13 8ET		
Proposal	First Floor Extension & Single Storey Side Extension		
Applicant	Mr Hadfield		
Town/Parish Council	Box Parish Council		
Electoral Division	Corsham Without and Box Hill	Unitary Member	Cllr Dick Tonge
Grid Ref	383347 169464		
Type of application	Full		
Case Officer	Chris Marsh	01249 706657	chris.marsh@wiltshire.gov.uk

Reason for the application being considered by Committee:

The application has been called in by the Unitary Member in order to consider the impact on the nearby listed building, residential amenity and the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty.

1. Purpose of Report

To consider the above application and to recommend that the decision is delegated to the Area Development Manager for planning permission to be GRANTED, subject to conditions.

Box Parish Council object to the application on the grounds that the proposed extension is overly large and would adversely affect the Green Belt setting of the site.

The application has attracted 4 letters of objection and 8 general comments in respect of the scheme.

2. Main Issues

The main issues in considering the application are:

- Principle of development
- Impact on the character and appearance of the host dwelling and its setting in an AONB
- Impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties
- Impact on highway safety

3. Site Description

The property is a detached cottage set into the Southern slope of the A4 main road through Box Hill. The building comprises an original two-storey cottage fronting directly onto the pavement, with a later linear extension to the Northeast and single-storey extension to the rear that gives the building an L-shaped footprint. Although relatively substantial, the rear extension is set into the bank, which slopes sharply up away from the highway. The existing extensions serve as kitchen and living/dining room respectively. The building is constructed from natural stone block, with a pitched slate roof and stone chimney stacks at either end of the original cottage element. Whilst the original building maintains significant character, particularly in terms of its Southwest elevation, the later extensions are of distinctly lesser quality; their slate roofs the only significant recognition of their context. The property features white uPVC windows and doors throughout. In general terms, the property does not readily engage with the main road and through its evolution has become strongly orientated toward the rear garden and Beech Road to the Southeast.

As the site is bounded on three sides by highway, parking is located to the rear of the property and accessed via Beech Road, which runs parallel to the A4 main road. Two parking spaces exist at the Southern corner of the site, which are currently surfaced in loose stone. The boundary between the site and the highway features a small triangular 'green' space, the ownership of which is currently unclear. However it is known that neither the green nor this section of Beech Road is under the control of Wiltshire Council and the application has been revised to exempt this area.

4. Relevant Planning History

There is no planning history relevant to the site.

5. Proposal

The proposed extension of the property is comprised of two principal elements, namely a straightforward ground floor linear extension at the Northwest corner and purely first-floor extension over the existing rear extension. Following negotiation, the scheme has been revised with amended plans altering the form and finish of the rear extension and reducing the site area.

The study element is to follow the existing front and rear build lines of the original cottage, fronting Box Hill, in order to provide an additional study adjoining the sitting room and the Northwest site boundary. In terms of design and materials, the extension represents a significant departure from the established vernacular of the property, with a planted flat roof over and timber boarded sides. The flat roof will keep the height of the extension down to 2.3m, retaining much of the end elevation of the original cottage, which includes a chimney stack, when viewed from further down Box Hill. This corner of the site is already relatively concealed from the neighbouring property, 'Magna', and Beech Road.

The first floor extension is to stand directly over the footprint of the existing rear element and extend a further 5m to the Southeast, with the sloping rear garden to be re-profiled to accommodate the building. Internally, the extension is to be configured as a single open plan kitchen/living space serving as the relocated access to the property from Beech Road. The Southwest side of the first floor is to be finished predominantly with powder-coated glazed panels, as are also to be installed in the same elevation of the existing element below, which is to become a separate bedroom with en suite.

The outward-facing elevations of the rear extension, along with the earlier extensions to the original cottage are to be clad in high-performance fibre cement panels, using a transitional colour scheme incorporating a mixture of grey and light yellow fibre cement panels arranged in 150mm courses.

The original submission included allocated off-street parking utilising an area of what is presently grass verge between Beech Road and the Southern site boundary. Owing to uncertainties as to the actual ownership of this land, the applicant has revised the site area by negotiation to provide parking on the two existing spaces to the Southwest of the property. It is however confirmed that the disputed land is not under the control of Wiltshire Council.

6. Consultations

Box Parish Council – objected to the original application for the following reason:

"This is an overlarge extension of the site which is in the Green Belt. The parking is shown on land which is not in the ownership of the applicant but which appears to be a highways verge and this is not acceptable. The application will be called in".

Amended plans have now been submitted and have been made available to the Parish Council for consideration and comment.

Highways – no objection Drainage – no objection, subject to conditions County Ecologist – no objection

7. Publicity

The application was advertised by site notice, press advert and neighbour consultation.

4 letters of objection received Summary of key relevant points raised:

- Overdevelopment of the property and site
- Inappropriate materials selected in context of Box Hill
- Extensions and landscaping will harm the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty
- Increase in accommodation will prompt increase in traffic and on-street parking
- Potential for enlarged dwelling to be converted into flats
- Increased risk of flooding due to increased building footprint

Objections have also made reference to the uncertainty of ownership of the land to the East of the property initially proposed as parking space. The applicant has subsequently revised plans to exclude this land from the application site in the absence of a definitive answer on this matter, incorporating adequate parking within the established curtilage of the property itself.

8. Planning Considerations

The relevant planning considerations are as follows:

Principle of development

Although the site is located within the Green Belt, limited extension of established properties is acceptable under the relevant policies (NE1 and H8 of the Local Plan). The proposed scheme involves a significant expansion of the existing built footprint – approximately 60% - and, despite being set-in to the rear of the site, will markedly increase the overall massing of the building. The theme of extension and alterations of properties in this location is well established, including at Braeside Cottage itself.

Impact on the character and appearance of the host dwelling and its setting in an AONB

In terms of its visibility from the main road, it is considered that the proposed extensions will have a minimal impact. The planted roof of the new study will significantly soften the impact of this element when viewed from Beech Road, from which wide-ranging views of open countryside are presently obtained. In regard to the boarded sides, one has to consider the fall-back position that the applicant could erect a fence to a similar height in this location under permitted development rights, giving much the same appearance. In any case, the limited height and massing of this element is such that the character of the original cottage, which is of some value, is conserved.

The rear extension represents a more significant increase in the overall massing of the building and requires careful consideration as to its impact on general character and appearance. Whilst the extension adjoins part of the rear elevation of the cottage, around half of this will obscure the earlier extension, which is of distinctly lesser aesthetic merit. Rather than disrupt the original roof form, the rear extension features a short linking section, setting the end of the new flat roof back from the cottage by approximately 1m. In terms of design and materials, the proposed extension does represent a departure from the existing property, and this is considered a ready distinction that enhances the legibility of the building and conserves its setting.

Following negotiation, the replacement of the proposed pitched roof of the rear extension with a partially planted flat roof represents a beneficial concession to the scale and conservation value of the original cottage slate roof, and will lend the extension a degree of subservience when viewed from the Northeast and from Beech Road. At present, the rear extension detracts, rather than enhances the setting of the original cottage despite its similar materials, and the departure in style will compliment the traditional form of the historic property.

Impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties

Owing to the relief of the site and low density of development in this location, the proposed extensions will not result in the loss of daylight or sunlight reaching neighbouring properties or otherwise adversely affect residential amenity by way of any general overbearing or overlooking. The planted boundary at the Western edge of the site will obscure views between the first floor extension and the garden of the neighbouring property, whilst the inward-orientation of the rear extension will minimise any impact on other surrounding properties.

Impact on highway safety

Vehicular access to the property remains unchanged, as will the parking arrangements under the revised plans. The existing two parking spaces to the rear of the property are to be resurfaced and maintained thereafter, providing adequate parking for a property of this size under countywide parking standards. The contested issue of the land adjacent has been put aside at this stage, given the sufficiency of parking already available.

Conclusions

The recommendation for approval is made on the grounds of scale and massing, as it is believed that the design principles and physical form of the proposed extensions are not incompatible with the existing building or its setting, which comprises a wide array of styles and materials, and will serve to enhance the site. The revised roof form addresses initial concerns regarding the scale of the extension and impact on the original cottage, which under the revised proposals is afforded greater prevalence in the context of the site. No objection is raised to the study extension to the Southwest of the original cottage, which is of a modest scale and design and will utilise an otherwise redundant patch of land. Overall, it is considered that alterations to the rear extension are rendered in such a way as to be sympathetic to the host dwelling insofar as its original character remains. Due to the relative containment of the scheme, the proposal will not have a detrimental effect upon the wider AONB and Green Belt.

9. Recommendation

That subject to no new and substantive issues being raised by the neighbours or Parish Council in respect of the amended plans, then the decision be delegated to the Area Development Manager for planning permission to be GRANTED for the following reason:

The proposed development, by reason of its siting, orientation, scale, massing, design and materials will not adversely affect the character and appearance of the host dwelling or its setting within the AONB and Green Belt. The proposal therefore accords with Policies C3, NE1, NE4, NE15 and H8 of the adopted North Wiltshire Local Plan 2011.

And subject to the following conditions:

1 The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

REASON: To comply with the provisions of Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 as amended by the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2 The external fibre cement surfaces shown on the agreed drawings for the development hereby approved shall be finished in the following colours in the agreed drawings received on 10 July 2012:

Eternit 'Natura' Fibre Cement, 7080 'Amber' Eternit 'Natura' Fibre Cement, N250 'Natural Grey' Eternit 'Natura' Fibre Cement, N891 'Beige' Eternit 'Natura' Fibre Cement, N251 'Anthracite'

Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details prior to the development being first brought into use unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

REASON: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of visual amenity and the character and appearance of the area.

3 The development hereby permitted shall not be occupied until the first five metres of the access/parking, measured from the edge of the carriageway, has been consolidated and surfaced (not loose stone or gravel). The access shall be maintained as such thereafter.

REASON: In the interests of highway safety.

4 The development hereby permitted shall not, at any time, be subdivided into a larger number of units.

REASON: In the interests of the amenity of the area and to enable the Local Planning Authority to consider individually whether planning permission should be granted for additional units on the site.

5 No development shall commence on site until a scheme for the discharge of surface water from the site (including surface water from the access/driveway), incorporating sustainable drainage details, has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall not be first occupied until surface water drainage has been constructed in accordance with the approved scheme.

REASON: To ensure that the development can be adequately drained.

6 The development hereby permitted shall be implemented in accordance with the submitted plans and documents listed below. No variation from the approved plans should be made without the prior approval of the local planning authority. Amendments may require the submission of a further application.

493:3:002 - Plans (proposed) Received 1 February 2012

493:3:001.C - Plan:Site:Roof (proposed) 493:3:003.B - Elevations (proposed) 493:3:004.B - Elevations (proposed) Received 5 July 2012

Sample fibre cement cladding sheets Received 10 July 2012

REASON: To ensure that the development is implemented as approved.

